

Appendix 2 - East Loch Lomond Traffic Management - Initial options to aid discussion and progress finding sustainable solutions

Ref:	Title	Description	Opportunities	Constraints	Roles and Responsibilities	Sustainability	Priority
Information							
In:1	Promotion of existing bus service	The 309 bus route is a regular service that travels from Balloch to Balmaha via Drymen. Increased use of this service could reduce vehicular pressure in Balmaha.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - May increase visitor numbers - Reduction of vehicular pressures up to Balmaha - Increases viability of bus route - Link with Scotrail to link journey promotion - CO2 reduction 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - May increase visitors numbers - Potential for negative effect on Balloch economy - Train links - Last journey capacity limits 	Potential lead; Stirling Council	Increased occupancy will increase long term viability	Medium (2019 - 2021)
In:2	Promotion of alternative destinations	Relieve pressure on the roads by suggesting other local destinations close to East Loch Lomond that still offer a high quality visitor experience but are not suffering from over tourism.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Reduce vehicular pressure on B837 - Increase economic activity in other areas of the National Park 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Increase pressures in other areas of the National Park - Could reduce custom to businesses along the B837 	Potential lead; National Park Authority	Ensure adequate monitoring is undertaken in promoted destination to address increased activity if needed	Medium (2019 - 2021)
In:3	Targeted social media	Use of targeted social media (coordinated with partners including local authorities, Traffic Scotland and Police Scotland) can reach a large number of people and help with journey planning. This is already in place but could be expanded along with other aligned communications.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Quick and relatively simple way of getting relevant information out - Offers real time and advanced messaging during and ahead of peak times 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Will not reach everyone - Need for good alternatives 	Potential lead; National Park Authority	National Park Authority commitment to providing visitor information	High (2018 - 2019)
Infrastructure and Services							
I&S:3	Install real-time vehicle counters	Real-time counters in the road (between Drymen and Balmaha) and beyond Balmaha would assist with monitoring and could be contacted to advanced warning systems. Real-time car park counters could help understand vehicle distribution to provide capacity information.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Increase knowledge of vehicular use to assist with monitoring - Use with other systems to control traffic 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - If installed as a standalone systems it may be difficult to integrate addition technology such as smart signage - Multiple ownership of thresholds 	Potential lead; Stirling Council	Counters will need to be monitored and maintained, service could be written into procurement	High (2018 - 2019)
I&S:4	Expansion of car park charging	The expansion of car park charging could help to fund the action plan and make any such scheme sustainable. Where possible a consistent approach should be developed to simplify the process, allowing visitors to comply easily with parking charges.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Revenue may help to subsidise some of the other elements of the plan - Different charging schemes could be used to 'direct traffic' 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Forest Enterprise Scotland and National Park Authority charging structures differ causing confusion and / or unequal distribution - Increase in irresponsible parking to avoid charge - Revenue not equally directed to sustaining the action plan 	Potential lead; National Park Authority	Depending on type of scheme and associated honesty rates the charge should assist with payment for the maintenance of the associated infrastructure	Medium (2019 - 2021)
I&S:5	Install Smart Signage	Smart signage could be used to allow visitors to better plan their destination and to avoid disappointment in advance of arrival. Signs at Drymen Bridge and A811 / A81 could provide advanced warning and promote alternative destinations. Signs before Balmaha could indicate car park capacity.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Remote way of controlling traffic flow and directing people to destinations that have capacity - Reduce congestion at car parks 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Infrastructure to maintain - Reduce custom to businesses along the B837 - Requires live monitoring to be fully effective - Increased urban infrastructure in rural setting 	Potential lead; Stirling Council	Stirling Council – will have existing signage that is serviced, extending contract would allow optimum savings	Medium (2019 - 2021)
I&S:6	Car Park expansion and redesign and new car parks	Additional car parking capacity for what is becoming a 'new normal' will help to reduce pressure at times that are not at peak demand. There may be opportunities if capacity was increased for redesign and facility improvements. Increasing capacity beyond Balmaha may not be suitable due to narrowness of the road. New car parks may be part of the mix and could be permanent or seasonal in nature.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Increased revenue - Increased capacity could allow for better layout and room for standalone toilet block - Dispersal of visitors increasing variety of visitor experiences 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Spaces may be underutilised during the winter. - Not currently in management or ownership - New facilities will need to be maintained and have adequate reasons for placement 	Potential lead; National Park Authority	Revenue to maintain extra meterage and other elements of the plan.	Low (2019 – 2023)

Ref:	Title	Description	Opportunities	Constraints	Roles and Responsibilities	Sustainability	Priority
I&S:7	Park and ride scheme	A simple 'Park and Ride' with associated shuttle would assist on peak demand weekends. Low key grass parking (potential to reinforce with matting) with bus stop, shelter and allowance for a barrier (if required in the future). Based between Drymen and Balmaha.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Reduce vehicular pressure on peak demand weekends - Increase economic opportunities 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Accusations of exclusivity if parking charges differed from main car park - Land would need to be procured - Risk of poor return on investment - Increased visitor numbers 	Potential lead; Stirling Council	Small charge and other car parking costs could help with sustainability.	Medium (2019 - 2021)
I&S:8	Landscape hardening	Barriers to protect soft verges and pavements at key locations where people are parking irresponsibly. Outside of car parks and known problem areas would be sensible, especially with the introduction of car park charging.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Reduce impact to environment - Increase accessibility on pavements - Increase safety for walkers - Smooth traffic flow and allow better vehicular access 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Poor material choice would have a negative visual impact - Poorly sited barriers could create pinch points and decrease traffic flow 	Potential lead; Stirling Council	Correct choice of material would require little or no continued maintenance.	Medium (2019 - 2021)
I&S:9	New shuttle / water bus service north of Balmaha	Both options could help to reduce the vehicular pressure north of Balmaha but would likely need to be run in conjunction with the Park and Ride to ensure unsustainable pressure is not put on Balmaha.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Reduce vehicular pressures north of Balmaha - Reduce CO2 emissions (potential for electric bus) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Viability of such services would require good occupancy rates - Increased visitor pressure at Balmaha without additional capacity 	Potential lead; National Park Authority	Consistent revenue stream	Low (2019 - 2023)
I&S:10	Physical restrictions to vehicular access	Installed as part of the Park and Ride infrastructure. This measure could be employed at peak demand times as a last resort and could reduce the need for Police Scotland presence.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Stops continued traffic pressure when safety of visitors, residents and people working is under threat 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Disruption to residents - Disruption to businesses 	Potential lead; Stirling Council	Staff requirement	Low (2019 - 2023)
Enforcement							
E:1	Effectively use current enforcement powers	Since the decriminalisation of parking enforcement in 2016, this responsibility has passed to Stirling Council. Officers have attended but unfortunately attendance has been sporadic and not at optimal times of the day.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Trained staff already employed and infrastructure in place to dispose of cases. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Currently not providing an effective deterrent due to lack of staff resource to cover the area regularly and at busiest visitor times. 	Potential lead; Stirling Council	Stirling Council would have to commit to regular enforcement for specific dates	High (2018 - 2019)
E:2	Create new enforcement model	Careful consideration should be given to the most effective use of staff deployment of public sector employees and with the appropriate consideration to funding agreements and revenue costs. Officers based locally could undertake multiple enforcement responsibilities including parking, litter, dog fouling and camping management byelaws.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Officers locally could undertake multiple enforcement duties and react quickly to issues before they arise. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Seasonality of role may make retention of good quality staff difficult - Negative publicity - Training requirement and cost of P.P.E and body cameras 	Potential lead; Stirling Council	Multi-agency contributions, car park revenue, revenue from parking related fixed penalty notices.	Medium (2019 - 2021)
Implementation and Coordination							
I&C:1	Establish management group	A group to drive the action plan forward, including preparation of a Rural Tourism Infrastructure Fund (RTIF) bid to help fund the initial actions. The East Loch Lomond Visitor Management Group could be a sensible vehicle for this.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Actions undertaken would have maximum buy in from all key stakeholders - Shared responsibilities may help to avoid bottlenecks in progress 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Poor support from authorities slows progress - Similar plans have not been enacted leading to difficulty forming a group - Other visit management issues could lead to mission creep 	Potential lead; National Park Authority	Clear actions, clear roles and responsibilities and continued progress will help to sustain this type of group.	High (2018 - 2019)
I&C:2	Create Peak Demand Response Plan	Elements of this plan such as the monitoring and smart signage will require coordination to work effectively. A plan, systems and procedures will need to be agreed by relevant partners.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Could be expanded to include other areas with traffic pressures - Single point of contact helps to avoid weak links 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Pressure on one partner to take responsibility for this important action 	Potential lead; National Park Authority	Would require long-term National Park Authority commitment to manage visitor pressures and provide staff cover on weekends.	Medium (2019 - 2021)
I&C:3	Establish monitoring	The effectiveness of the measures actioned will need to be monitored. This may include numbers	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Provide evidence for success of measures 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Additional work will be needed to maintain and analyse data sets 	Potential lead; National Park Authority	Would require long-term National Park	Medium (2019 -

Ref:	Title	Description	Opportunities	Constraints	Roles and Responsibilities	Sustainability	Priority
	framework	of vehicles, use of shuttles buses and water taxis, occupancy rates on public transport, number of parking tickets issued and car park occupancy rates. Some of the monitoring methods designed for the National Park Authority 'Your Park' project may be able to be used and adapted.	- Provide evidence of business and service viability - Allow for informed management decisions	- Poor contribution of data will reduce the effectiveness of the scheme		Authority commitment to managing visitor pressures.	2021)

Note 1: whilst a lead partner will be needed to coordinate and drive forward these individual solutions when agreed, they will be less likely to succeed without active partner engagement and support.

Partners may include (but not be exclusive to):

- Loch Lomond and The Trossachs National Park Authority (Visitor Management, Estates, Visitor Experience, Access and Recreation Teams)
- Stirling Council (Transport, Safer Communities, Economic Development sections)
- Forestry Commission Scotland
- Police Scotland
- National Trust Scotland
- Community Council and Community Development Trusts
- Local Businesses
- Local Landowners

Note 2: Priorities are suggestions prior to wider discussion.